

Central Valley Regional Water Quality Control Board

HEARING PROCEDURE
FOR ADMINISTRATIVE CIVIL LIABILITY COMPLAINT
R5-2010-0541

ISSUED TO

TSAR NICOULAI CAVIAR, LLC
TSAR NICOULAI STURGEON FARM
SACRAMENTO COUNTY

SCHEDULED FOR 25/26 JULY 2013

PLEASE READ THIS HEARING PROCEDURE CAREFULLY. FAILURE TO COMPLY WITH THE DEADLINES AND OTHER REQUIREMENTS CONTAINED HEREIN MAY RESULT IN THE EXCLUSION OF YOUR DOCUMENTS AND/OR TESTIMONY.

Background

The Executive Officer has issued an Administrative Civil Liability (ACL) Complaint pursuant to California Water Code (CWC) section 13323 to Tsar Nicoulai Caviar, LLC, alleging violations of CWC section 13385 for discharges from the Discharger's wastewater treatment system that exceeded permitted effluent limitations.

The Complaint proposes that an administrative civil liability in the amount of \$23,000 be imposed. The original liability was \$27,000, of which the Discharger has previously paid \$4,000. A hearing is currently scheduled to be conducted before the Central Valley Water Board during its 25/26 July 2013 meeting.

Purpose of Hearing

The purpose of the hearing is to consider relevant evidence and testimony regarding the ACL Complaint. At the hearing, the Central Valley Water Board will consider whether to issue an administrative civil liability order assessing the proposed liability, or a higher or lower amount, or reject the proposed liability. The public hearing on 30/31 May 2013 will commence at 8:30 a.m. or as soon thereafter as practical, or as announced in the Central Valley Water Board meeting agenda. The meeting will be held at:

11020 Sun Center Drive, Suite 200, Rancho Cordova, California

An agenda for the meeting will be issued at least ten days before the meeting and posted on the Central Valley Water Board's web page at:

http://www.waterboards.ca.gov/centralvalley/board_info/meetings

Hearing Procedures

The hearing will be conducted in accordance with this Hearing Procedure. This Hearing Procedure has been approved by the Central Valley Water Board Chair in model format, and is subject to further revision by the Central Valley Water Board's Advisory Team or the Chair. A copy of the general procedures governing adjudicatory hearings before the Central Valley Water

Board may be found at California Code of Regulations, title 23, section 648 et seq., and is available at <http://www.waterboards.ca.gov> or upon request. In accordance with section 648, subdivision (d), any procedure not provided by this Hearing Procedure is deemed waived. Except as provided in section 648, subdivision (b) and herein, Chapter 5 of the Administrative Procedures Act (commencing with Gov't Code § 11500) does not apply to this hearing.

ANY OBJECTIONS TO THE HEARING PROCEDURE MUST BE RECEIVED BY THE CENTRAL VALLEY WATER BOARD'S ADVISORY TEAM NO LATER THAN 6 MAY 2013 OR THEY WILL BE WAIVED. FAILURE TO COMPLY WITH THE DEADLINES AND REQUIREMENTS CONTAINED HEREIN MAY RESULT IN THE EXCLUSION OF DOCUMENTS AND/OR TESTIMONY.

The Discharger shall contact the Prosecution Team to try to resolve objections regarding due dates, the hearing date and hearing time limits BEFORE submitting objections to the Advisory Team.

Hearing Participants

Participants in this proceeding are designated as either "parties" or "interested persons." Designated parties to the hearing may present evidence and cross-examine witnesses and are subject to cross-examination. Interested persons may present non-evidentiary policy statements, but may not cross-examine witnesses and are not subject to cross-examination. Interested persons generally may not present evidence (e.g., photographs, eye-witness testimony, monitoring data). Both designated parties and interested persons may be asked to respond to clarifying questions from the Central Valley Water Board, staff or others, at the discretion of the Central Valley Water Board.

The following participants are hereby designated as parties in this proceeding:

1. Central Valley Water Board Prosecution Team
2. Tsar Nicoulai Caviar, LLC

Requesting Designated Party Status

Persons who wish to participate in the hearing as a designated party must request party status by submitting a request in writing (with copies to the existing designated parties) that that it is received no later than **5 p.m. on 6 May 2013**, by the Advisory Team attorney (contact information listed below). The request shall include an explanation of the basis for status as a designated party (i.e., how the issues to be addressed in the hearing and the potential actions by the Central Valley Water Board affect the person, and the need to present evidence or cross-examine witnesses), the information required of designated parties as provided below, and a statement explaining why the party or parties designated above do not adequately represent the person's interest. Any opposition to the request must be received by the Advisory Team, the person requesting party status, and all other parties by **5 p.m. on 10 May 2013**. The parties will be notified by 5 p.m. on **30 May 2013** whether the request has been granted or denied.

Primary Contacts

Advisory Team:

Clay Rodgers, Assistant Executive Officer
1685 "E" Street, Suite 100
Fresno, CA 93706-2007
Phone: (559) 445-5102
croders@waterboards.ca.gov

Alex Mayer, Attorney
State Water Resources Control Board, Office of Chief Counsel
Physical Address: 1001 I Street, Sacramento, CA 95814
Mailing Address: P.O. Box 100, Sacramento, CA 95812
Phone: (916) 322-5051; fax: (916) 341-5199
amayer@waterboards.ca.gov

Prosecution Team:

Pamela Creedon, Executive Officer
Wendy Wyels, Environmental Program Manager
Nichole Morgan, Senior Engineer
Mike Fischer, Water Resources Control Engineer
11020 Sun Center Drive, Suite 200, Rancho Cordova, CA 95670
Phone: (916) 464-4835; fax: (916) 464-4681
wwyels@waterboards.ca.gov

Laura Drabandt, Attorney
State Water Resources Control Board, Office of Enforcement
Physical Address: 1001 I Street, Sacramento, CA 95814
Mailing Address: P.O. Box 100, Sacramento, CA 95812
Phone: (916) 341-5180; fax: (916) 341-5896
ldrabandt@waterboards.ca.gov

Discharger:

Marion Mahone
Former General Manager, Tsar Nicoulai Caviar, LLC
60 Dorman Avenue
San Francisco, CA 94124
marion@tsarnicoulai.com

Separation of Functions

To help ensure the fairness and impartiality of this proceeding, the functions of those who will act in a prosecutorial role by presenting evidence for consideration by the Central Valley Water Board (Prosecution Team) have been separated from those who will provide advice to the Central Valley Water Board (Advisory Team). Members of the Advisory Team are: Mr. Clay Rodgers and Mr. Alex Mayer. Members of the Prosecution Team are: Ms. Pamela Creedon; Ms. Wendy Wyels, Ms. Nichole Morgan, Mr. Mike Fischer, and Ms. Laura Drabandt. Any members of the Advisory Team who normally supervise any members of the Prosecution Team are not acting as their supervisors in this proceeding, and vice versa. Pamela Creedon regularly advises the Central Valley Water Board in other, unrelated matters, but is not advising the Central Valley Water Board in this proceeding. Other members of the Prosecution Team act or

have acted as advisors to the Central Valley Water Board in other, unrelated matters, but they are not advising the Central Valley Water Board in this proceeding. Members of the Prosecution Team have not had any ex parte communications with the members of the Central Valley Water Board or the Advisory Team regarding this proceeding.

Ex Parte Communications

The designated parties and interested persons are forbidden from engaging in ex parte communications regarding this matter with members of the Advisory Team or members of the Central Valley Water Board. An ex parte communication is any written or verbal communication pertaining to the investigation, preparation, or prosecution of the ACL Complaint between a member of a designated party or interested person on the one hand, and a Central Valley Water Board member or an Advisory Team member on the other, unless the communication is copied to all other designated parties (if written) or made in a manner open to all other designated parties (if verbal). Communications regarding non-controversial procedural matters are not ex parte contacts and are not restricted. Communications among one or more designated parties and interested persons themselves are not ex parte contacts.

The following communications to the Advisory Board must be copied to all designated parties: Objections to these Hearing Procedures; request for modifications to these Hearing Procedures; requests for designated party status, or objections thereto; and all written evidence, legal argument or policy statements from designated parties. This is not an all-inclusive list of ex parte communications.

Hearing Time Limits

To ensure that all participants have an opportunity to participate in the hearing, the following time limits shall apply: each designated party shall have a combined 30 minutes to present evidence (including evidence presented by witnesses called by the designated party), cross-examine witnesses (if warranted), and provide a closing statement; and each interested person shall have 3 minutes to present a non-evidentiary policy statement. Participants with similar interests or comments are requested to make joint presentations, and participants are requested to avoid redundant comments. Participants who would like additional time must submit their request to the Advisory Team so that it is received by 5:00 p.m. on **25 June 2013**. Additional time may be provided at the discretion of the Advisory Team (prior to the hearing) or the Central Valley Water Board Chair (at the hearing) upon a showing that additional time is necessary. Such showing shall explain what testimony, comments, or legal argument require extra time, and why the Discharger could not adequately provide the testimony, comments or legal argument in writing before the hearing.

If *new* rebuttal evidence or argument is accepted after the above date, designated parties shall submit any requests for additional time to respond to the rebuttal no later than **9 July 2013**. In most cases, additional time will not be necessary to respond to rebuttal.

A timer will be used, but will not run during Board questions or the responses to such questions, or during discussions of procedural issues.

Submission of Evidence and Policy Statements

Case in Chief: The Prosecution Team, the Discharger and each other designated party must submit the following information in writing in advance of the hearing:

1. All evidence (other than witness testimony to be presented orally at the hearing) that the Designated Party would like the Central Valley Water Board to consider. Evidence and exhibits already in the public files of the Central Valley Board may be submitted by reference as long as the exhibits and their location are clearly identified in accordance with California Code of Regulations, title 23, section 648.3. Board members will not generally receive copies of materials incorporated by reference, and the referenced materials are generally not posted on the Board's website.
2. All legal and technical arguments or analysis.
3. The name of each witness, if any, whom the designated party intends to call at the hearing, the subject of each witness' proposed testimony, and the estimated time required by each witness to present direct testimony. (This information is not required for rebuttal witnesses or rebuttal testimony.)
4. The qualifications of each expert witness, if any. (This information is not required for rebuttal witnesses.)

The Prosecution Team's information must include the legal and factual basis for its claims against each Discharger; a list or attached copy of all evidence on which the Prosecution Team relies, which must include, at a minimum, all documents cited in the complaint or Staff Report no later than the due date under Important Deadlines, below.

The Prosecution Team shall submit one hard copy and one electronic copy to Mr. Clay Rodgers and one electronic copy to Mr. Alex Mayer. Each other designated party shall submit 3 hard copies and one electronic copy to Mr. Clay Rodgers and one electronic copy to Mr. Alex Mayer. Mr. Clay Rodgers and Mr. Alex Mayer must receive all submissions no later than 5:00 p.m. on the applicable due date under Important Deadlines, below.

Rebuttal: Any designated party that would like to submit evidence, legal analysis, or policy statements to rebut the information previously submitted by other designated parties shall submit 3 hard copies of their rebuttal information to Mr. Clay Rodgers and one electronic copy of the information to Mr. Alex Mayer so that they are received by 5 p.m. on the due date under Important Deadlines, below. "Rebuttal" means evidence, analysis or comments offered to disprove or contradict other designated parties' submissions. Rebuttal shall be limited to the scope of the materials previously submitted by the other designated parties. Rebuttal information that is not responsive to information previously submitted by other designated parties may be excluded.

Copies: Board members will receive copies of all materials submitted in hard copy or electronic format. The Board's copies will be printed in black and white from the designated parties' electronic copies. Designated parties who are concerned about print quality of all or any part of their written materials should submit a high-resolution pdf or provide an extra nine paper copies for the Board members. For items with voluminous submissions, Board members may receive copies electronically only. Electronic copies are also posted on the Board's website.

Parties without access to computer equipment are strongly encouraged to have their materials scanned at a copy and mailing center. However, the Board will not reject materials solely for failure to provide electronic copies.

By **3 July 2013**, the Prosecution Team shall prepare a summary agenda sheet ("buff sheet") for this item to be included in the Board members' agenda package and posted on the internet. The buff sheet shall clearly state that it was prepared by the Prosecution Team. The Prosecution Team shall provide a copy of the buff sheet to all parties by mail or email.

Interested Persons who would like to submit written non-evidentiary policy statements are encouraged to submit them to the Advisory Team as early as possible, but they must be received by **2 July 2013**. Interested Persons do not need to submit written comments in order to speak at the hearing.

In accordance with California Code of Regulations, title 23, section 648.4, the Central Valley Water Board endeavors to avoid surprise testimony or evidence. Absent a showing of good cause and lack of prejudice to the parties, the Central Valley Water Board may exclude evidence and testimony that is not submitted in accordance with this Hearing Procedure. Excluded evidence and testimony will not be considered by the Central Valley Water Board and will not be included in the administrative record for this proceeding. Power Point and other visual presentations may be used at the hearing, but their content may not exceed the scope of other submitted written material. Designated parties must provide the Advisory Team with a printed copy of such materials at or before the hearing, for inclusion in the administrative record. Additionally, any witness who has submitted written testimony for the hearing shall appear at the hearing and affirm that the written testimony is true and correct, and shall be available for cross-examination.

Evidentiary Documents and File

The Complaint and related evidentiary documents are on file and may be inspected or copied at the Central Valley Water Board office at 11020 Sun Center Drive, Rancho Cordova, CA 95670. This file shall be considered part of the official administrative record for this hearing. Other submittals received for this proceeding will be added to this file and will become a part of the administrative record absent a contrary ruling by the Central Valley Water Board's Chair. Many of these documents are also posted on-line at:

http://www.waterboards.ca.gov/centralvalley/board_decisions/tentative_orders/index.shtml

Although the web page is updated regularly, to assure access to the latest information, you may contact Wendy Wyels (contact information above).

Questions

Questions concerning this proceeding may be addressed to the Advisory Team attorney (contact information above).

IMPORTANT DEADLINES

(Note: the Central Valley Water Board is required to provide a hearing within 90 days of issuance of the Complaint (CWC § 13323). The Advisory Team will generally adhere to this schedule unless the discharger submits a waiver and it is accepted.)

All Required submissions must be received by 5:00 p.m. on the due date.

| | |
|-----------------|---|
| 8 March 2013 | Prosecution Team issues proposed Hearing Procedure to Advisory Team. |
| 6 May 2013 | Objections due on proposed Hearing Procedure |
| 6 May 2013 | Deadline for submission of request for designated party status. |
| 10 May 2013 | Deadline for opposition to request for designated party status. |
| 30 May 2013 | Advisory Team issues decision on requests for designated party status, if any. |
| 5 June 2013 | Prosecution Tem submits an electronic copy to Clay Rodgers and Alex Mayer of all documents cited in the complaint or Staff Report, unless previously submitted. |
| 25 June 2013 | Remaining Designated Parties' (including the Discharger's) deadline for submission of all information required under "Evidence and Policy Statements," above. |
| 25 June 2013 | Requests for additional hearing time (see Hearing Time Limits, above). |
| 2 July 2013 | All Designated Parties shall submit any rebuttal evidence, written rebuttal to legal argument and/or written rebuttal to policy statements; and all evidentiary objections to other Designated Parties' submittals. |
| 2 July 2013 | Interested persons' comments are due. |
| 3 July 2013 | Prosecution Team's deadline to submit Buff Sheet. |
| 9 July 2013 | If <i>new</i> rebuttal evidence or argument is submitted, deadline for designated parties to submit any requests for additional time at the hearing to respond to the rebuttal. |
| 25/26 July 2013 | Hearing |